



**Date:** March 1, 2018

**To:** Easthampton School Building Committee

**From:** Mel Overmoyer & Alan Minkus, OPM for Easthampton Schools Project  
Colliers International

**Subject:** Easthampton Maple Street Elementary School Summary Options Analysis Report

Dear SBC members,

Per your request Colliers has prepared this Summary Options Analysis Report for your use. The analysis consists of 4 exhibits as follows:

- Exhibit I: Summary of Options as submitted to MSBA in Preferred Schematic Report
- Exhibit II: Summary of Repair Costs for Elementary and Middle Schools
- Exhibit III: Summary of New PreK-4 and Grade 5-8 Schools
- Exhibit IV: Summary of New PreK-8 Options E.1, E.2, E.3, E.4

**Notes, clarifications, and assumptions related to the Exhibits**

1. MSBA will only fund one major building project at a time. Easthampton's current invitation to participate in MSBA grant process must include the Maple Steet School.
2. The majority of information included in Exhibit I is included in the Preferred Schematic Report (PSR) submitted to the MSBA on November 9, 2017 with an updated submission dated February 21, 2018. The November 9<sup>th</sup> version has been on the Easthampton Public School website for some time now. The February 21<sup>st</sup> version has recently been posted on the website. The version of Exhibit I submitted to the MSBA is located on page 484 of 888 in the November submission and on page 610 of 1058 of the February submission.
3. The detail of the construction cost estimates is also included in the PSR Reports as Appendix E.
4. The February 2018 PSR report updated the November 2017 PSR report to reflect the SBC direction to submit Option E.4 which repositioned the building and moved the existing football field.
5. The Exhibit I in this report has modified the submitted chart to include the "Districts Anticipated Portion" for each option. This information is not required by the MSBA in the PSR report because the MSBA focuses on total project cost and purposely leaves out any MSBA grant amount due to the preliminary nature of the design and the cost estimates.
6. Colliers has provided early analysis of the cost estimates for each design option to provide an "area of magnitude" amount of the anticipated and possible MSBA grant amount based on our experience with numerous other MSBA funded projects and per the MSBA budgeting form 3011. The form 3011 is a complex spreadsheet that is designed to assign and evaluate many aspects of the project budget such as reimbursement rates, eligible versus ineligible costs, escalation, contingencies, fees, etc. Therefore the MSBA grant and resulting District's Anticipated Portion included in this report are preliminary in nature.
7. The scenarios developed in Exhibits II, III, and IV are devised to identify likely or possible long-term strategies that Easthampton may employ to modernize all of its Pre-K to 8 facilities. There are clearly more strategies or variations with different assumptions that could be identified but those listed are meant to capture the broadest range of options to address all the PreK-8 student population recognizing the New High School facility already in place.

# Easthampton Maple Street Elementary School

# Exhibit I

## Summary of Options as submitted to MSBA in Preferred Schematic Report (PSR)

1-Mar-18

CONCEPTUAL COST SUMMARY - DESIGN ALTERNATIVES								
Option (Description)	Total Area (GSF)	Square Feet Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet New Construction	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost	Estimated Construction (Cost/sf)	Estimated Total Project Cost	District's Anticipated Portion	Blended/Net Reimbursement Rate
Alternative A. (Base Repair)	37,233	37,233 sf \$354.00 \$/sf \$13,169,046	0 sf \$0	\$2,138,900	\$15,348,379 \$ 412.23 /sf	\$21,875,776 \$587.54 /sf	\$8,955,969	59.00%
Alternative D. PreK-4 ES (New)	96,225	0 sf \$0	95423 sf \$473.00 \$/sf \$45,123,882	\$4,480,799	\$49,604,681 \$ 515.51 /sf	\$60,529,401 \$629.04 /sf	\$34,747,628	42.59%
Alternative E.1 PreK-8 (Minor Add-Reno)	178,757	115,577 sf \$397.00 \$/sf \$45,891,528	63,180 sf \$484.00 \$/sf \$30,594,352	\$10,703,495	\$87,189,375 \$ 487.75 /sf	\$107,593,038 \$601.90 /sf	\$53,964,983	46.81%
Alternative E.2 PreK-8 (Major Add-Reno)	177,746	38,993 sf \$458.00 \$/sf \$17,863,697	138,753 sf \$456.00 \$/sf \$63,334,925	\$10,351,716	\$91,550,338 \$ 515.06 /sf	\$112,737,317 \$634.26 /sf	\$61,724,107	45.25%
Alternative E.3 PreK-8 (New)	176,155	0 sf \$0	176,155 sf \$451.00 \$/sf \$79,377,098	\$11,290,225	\$90,667,323 \$ 514.70 /sf	\$109,815,354 \$623.40 /sf	\$62,338,901	43.23%
Alternative E.4 PreK-8 (New)	176,155	0 sf \$0	176,155 sf \$446.00 \$/sf \$78,618,680	\$11,616,284	\$90,234,964 \$ 512.25 /sf	\$109,308,415 \$620.52 /sf	\$59,710,324	45.37%
Alternative F. 5-8 M.S. (New)	100,720	0 sf \$0	100,720 sf \$458.70 \$/sf \$46,199,810	\$4,803,709	\$51,003,519 \$ 506.39 /sf	\$61,963,143 \$615.20 /sf	\$35,263,467	43.09%

# Easthampton Maple Street Elementary School

## Summary of Repair Costs for Elementary and Middle Schools

1-Mar-18

Exhibit II

### Scenario 1: Repair Only all 4 schools

(Maple in current program; Center, Pepin, White Brook in Accelerated Repair Program)

	phase 1	phase 2	phase 3	phase 4	Totals
	Maple Street	Center Street	White Brook	Pepin	
a completion year	2021	2023	2025	2027	
b current project cost (millions)	\$21.88	\$9.90	\$61.65	\$24.60	
c escalation in years	in current estimate	2	4	6	
d Escalation factor (4%/yr)	in current estimate	8.16%	16.98%	26.53%	
e Escalation cost (millions)	in current estimate	\$0.81	\$10.47	\$6.53	
f Total project cost (millions)	\$21.88	\$10.71	\$72.12	\$31.13	<b>\$135.83</b>
g <b>District Portion (millions)</b>	<b>\$8.96</b>	<b>\$9.10</b>	<b>\$61.30</b>	<b>\$26.46</b>	<b>\$105.82</b>
h Net Reimbursement	59.00%	15.00%	15.00%	15.00%	<b>22.09%</b>
i New Prek-8 school District Portion					<b>\$59.71</b>
j <b>Cost reduction for New Prek-8</b>					<b>\$46.11</b>

#### Assumptions:

- 1 Complete repair of Maple in current MSBA program
- 2 Center, White Brook, and Pepin assumed to be repaired under MSBA "Accelerated Repair Program"
- 3 MSBA Repair grants are for building systems only (exterior windows and doors, roofs, and boilers)
- 4 Assumes Accelerated repair of systems would constitute MSBA grant yielding 15% net reimbursement
- 5 Assumes Easthampton reimbursement rate same as current at 57.74% of "eligible" costs

#### Results:

- 6 Total cost to repair all 4 buildings in this scenario at \$135.85 million with \$105.84 by District
- 7 Total cost to build new Prek-8 to be \$109.31 million with \$59.71 by District (\$46.13 million less)
- 8 Requires students to be relocated to modulars or other swing space for each phase
- 9 This approach only repairs the buildings for system upgrades and code compliance.
- 10 This approach does not address the program space changes for current educational standards
- 11 This approach will retain the undesirable site conditions at the elementary school (parking, playground, etc)

# Easthampton Maple Street Elementary School

Exhibit III

## Summary of New PreK-4 & Grade 5-8 Schools

1-Mar-18

### Scenario 2: Build new PreK-4 now, Build new grade 5-8 in 8 years

(same time frame from High School to this project)

	phase 1 new Prek -4	phase 2 new grade 5-8	Totals
a completion year	2021	2029	
b current project cost (millions)	\$60.53	\$61.96	
c escalation in years	in current estimate	8	
d Escalation factor (4%/yr)	in current estimate	36.86%	
e Escalation cost (millions)	in current estimate	\$22.84	
f Total project cost (millions)	\$60.53	\$84.80	<b>\$145.33</b>
<b>g District Portion (millions)</b>	<b>\$37.75</b>	<b>\$42.40</b>	<b>\$80.15</b>
h Net Reimbursement	42.59%	50.00%	<b>44.85%</b>
New Prek-8 school District Portion			<b>\$59.71</b>
<b>Cost reduction for New Prek-8</b>			<b>\$20.44</b>

#### Assumptions:

- 1 Replace Maple, Center, and Pepin with new PreK-4 school at White Brook site in current program.
- 2 Replace White Brook with new grade 5-8 school in 8 years (same timeframe as High School project to current)
- 3 Assumes MSBA will invite White Brook in Renovation/New Construction program which it has not done to date.
- 4 Assumes higher reimbursement for new grade 5-8 than current for Prek-4 (50% vs 42.59%) given less site work

#### Results:

- 5 Total cost for New PreK-4 & New grade 5-8 in 8 years is \$145.32 million with \$80.15 million by District
- 6 Total cost to build new Prek-8 to be \$109.31 million with \$59.71 by District (\$20.44 million less)
- 7 Existing White Brook remains for a total of 12 more years.
- 8 Repairs to keep White Brook operating given its poor conditions for another 12 years not included
- 9 Does not address preferred grade realignment of Prek-5 and grades 6-8

**Easthampton Maple Street Elementary School**  
**Summary of New PreK-8 School Options E.1, E.2, E.3, E.4**  
*1-Mar-18*

**Exhibit IV**

**Scenario 3: Build new PreK - 8 now**

(Four different designs for the new PreK-8 new building)

	<b>Scheme E.1</b>	<b>Scheme E.2</b>	<b>Scheme E.3</b>	<b>Scheme E.4</b>
a completion year	2022	2022	2021	2021
b current project cost (millions)	\$107.59	\$112.74	\$109.82	\$60.52
c escalation in years	in current estimate	in current estimate	in current estimate	in current estimate
d Escalation factor (4%/yr)	in current estimate	in current estimate	in current estimate	in current estimate
e Escalation cost (millions)	in current estimate	in current estimate	in current estimate	in current estimate
f Total project cost (millions)	\$107.59	\$112.74	\$109.82	\$109.30
<b>g District Portion (millions)</b>	<b>\$53.96</b>	<b>\$61.72</b>	<b>\$62.94</b>	<b>\$59.71</b>
h Net Reimbursement	46.81%	45.25%	43.23%	45.37%

**Assumptions:**

- 1 Scheme E.1: This scheme attempts to renovate and reuse a larger portion of the existing White Brook building and building a smaller addition for the new Prek to 8 program
- 2 Scheme E.2: This scheme attempts to renovate and reuse a smaller portion of the existing White Brook building and building a larger addition for the new Prek to 8 program
- 3 Scheme E.3: This scheme builds an entirely new PreK-8 building while attempting to preserve the existing football field
- 4 Scheme E.4: This scheme builds an entirely new PreK-8 building and builds a new football field in a new location

**Results:**

- 5 Total costs for all these schemes for the New PreK-8 building vary from \$107.59 million to \$112.74 million
- 6 Total cost to the District for all these schemes vary from a low of \$53.96 million to \$62.94 million
- 7 Schemes E.1 and E.2 requires phases that involves moving students from existing to new then into renovated areas therefore lengthening the construction time
- 8 Schemes E.1 and E.2 do not as fully accommodate the preferred PreK-8 educational space program
- 9 Scheme E.3 places the new building in a less desirable location on the site once the project is fully completed
- 10 Scheme E.4 results in losing the use of the existing football field during construction
- 11 No swing space required for E.3 or E.4